#### **MAY 23, 2013 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

67. JESTON MURRAY V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **OPINION OF THE COURT BY CHIEF JUSTICE MINTON – AFFIRMING** 

> ABRAMSON, CUNNINGHAM, KELLER, NOBLE AND VENTERS, JJ., CONCUR. SCOTT, J., CONCURS IN RESULT ONLY.

2011-SC-000081-MR

**JEFFERSON** 

### TO BE PUBLISHED

#### **Questions Presented:**

Two counts of complicity to commit murder, first-degree robbery, first-degree burglary, and two counts of tampering with physical evidence. Admission of prior consistent statement. Joinder of two counts of murder in a single indictment. RCr 6.18. Tampering with physical evidence charges did not violate defendant's right against selfincrimination. No error in permitting testimony of alleged homosexual conduct between defendant and an accomplice, or in failing to instruct the jury on criminal facilitation to murder and robbery.

68. STEVEN R. COX V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **OPINION OF THE COURT BY** JUSTICE ABRAMSON -**AFFIRMING** 

> MINTON, C.J.; CUNNINGHAM, KELLER NOBLE AND VENTERS, JJ., CONCUR. SCOTT, J., CONCURS IN RESULT ONLY.

REGINALD L. GRIDER V. 69. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY **OPINION OF THE COURT BY** JUSTICE CUNNINGHAM -**AFFIRMING** 

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2011-SC-000656-MR TO BE PUBLISHED

**HARDIN** 

#### **Questions Presented:**

First-degree possession of a controlled substance, firearm enhanced; possession of a handgun by a convicted felon; and PFOII-20 years. Parole officer's incomplete testimony regarding sentencing credits potentially available to parolees was not misleading and did not amount to palpable error.

2012-SC-000454-MR TO BE PUBLISHED

**JEFFERSON** 

#### **Questions Presented:**

Murder, first-degree robbery and intimidating a participant in the legal process-Life imprisonment. KRS 532.025 does not bar a jury from sentencing juveniles to LWOP 25. Jury selection. Validity of RCr 9.40-number of peremptory challenges in a criminal case.

### **MAY 23, 2013 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

70. PATRICIA HORNBACK V.
HARDIN MEMORIAL HOSPITAL;
HONORABLE CAROLINE PITT CLARK,
ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE; AND
WORKERS' COMPENSATION BOARD
OPINION OF THE COURT
REVERSING

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2012-SC-000195-WC FROM COURT TO BE PUBLISHED OF APPEALS

#### **Questions Presented:**

Workers' Compensation. Issues presented in this case include whether an employee who was injured during an unsuccessful rescue from a stalled elevator is entitled to an enhancement of her workers' compensation award pursuant to KRS 342.165(1), which penalizes an employer for an intentional failure to follow a safety protocol; and according to the four part test provided in *Lexington-Fayette Urban County Government v. Offutt*, 11 S.W.3d 598 (Ky. App. 2000).

71. LINDA S. GRUBB, ETC., ET AL. V.
NORTON HOSPITALS, INC., ET AL.
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE CUNNINGHAM –
REVERSING AND REMANDING
NOBLE, SCOTT AND VENTERS, JJ.,
CONCUR. MINTON, C.J., CONCURS IN
RESULT ONLY BY SEPARATE
OPINION IN WHICH ABRAMSON AND
KELLER, JJ., JOIN.

**2010-SC-000532-DG TO BE PUBLISHED** 

**JEFFERSON** 

#### **Questions Presented:**

Jury Selection. Agency. Evidence
Admissibility. The issues include: whether
the trial court erred by failing to strike three
jurors for cause; whether the trial court
erred by entering summary judgment on
agency issues, and whether the trial court
erred by failing to allow the plaintiffs to
introduce evidence that the doctors and
hospital were covered by the same liability
insurance.

### **MAY 23, 2013 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

72. STEWART M. TURLEY V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
JUSTICE VENTERS –
REVERSING AND REMANDING
ABRAMSON, CUNNINGHAM, KELLER,
NOBLE AND SCOTT, JJ., CONCUR.
MINTON, C.J., CONCURS IN RESULT
ONLY.

**2011-SC-000276-MR TO BE PUBLISHED** 

MUHLENBERG

#### **Questions Presented:**

First-degree possession of a controlled substance, possession of marijuana and PFOII-20 years. Trial court erred in denying a motion to suppress drug-related evidence seized during a routine traffic stop because its discovery was the product of a custodial detainment which extended beyond the scope of the original purpose of the traffic stop in violation of the Fourth Amendment.

73. LINDA KAYE SAMONS, ETC. V.
KENTUCKY FARM BUREAU MUTUAL
INSURANCE COMPANY
OPINION OF THE COURT BY
CHIEF JUSTICE MINTON –
REVERSING AND REMADING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2011-SC-000414-DG TO BE PUBLISHED

**FLOYD** 

#### **Questions Presented:**

Insurance. Motor Vehicle. Basic Reparation Benefits. Issues involve responsibility for paying basic reparation benefits on behalf of an uninsured rider on horseback injured in a collision with an uninsured motor vehicle driven by an insured. Specifically, can that driver's insurer be excluded from responsibility for paying BRBs, to be covered instead through the Assigned Claims Plan?

74. RYAN KRISTOFF V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
MEMORANDUM OPINION OF
THE COURT – AFFIRMING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2011-SC-000680-MR
NOT TO BE PUBLISHED

**CHRISTIAN** 

75. JAMES E. HARVEY V.
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
MEMORANDUM OPINION OF
THE COURT – AFFIRMING
ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

2011-SC-000729-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED **JEFFERSON** 

## **MAY 23, 2013 MINUTES**

76.	LARRY D. BURNETT V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2012-SC-000045-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	TODD
77.	IVAN ORANTES-PIERCE V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT – <u>AFFIRMING</u> ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2012-SC-000209-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	JEFFERSON
78.	ERIC LLOYD HERMANSEN V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - AFFIRMING ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2012-SC-000297-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	GALLATIN
79.	MONTRIAL DEMETRIUS JOHNSON V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY MEMORANDUM OPINION OF THE COURT - AFFIRMING IN PART AND REVERSING AND REMANDING IN PART MINTON, C.J.; ABRAMSON, CUNNINGHAM, NOBLE, SCOTT, AND VENTERS, JJ., CONCUR. KELLER, J., DISSENTS.	2011-SC-000491-MR NOT TO BE PUBLISHED	FAYETTE

#### **MAY 23, 2013 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

### **OPINIONS AND ORDERS - MAY 15, 2013**

TODD SEXTON V. 2012-SC-000662-D PERRY

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY

ORDER DENIED DISCRETIONARY REVIEW WITH RESPECT TO THE SUPPRESSION ISSUE, GRANTED DISCRETIONARY REVIEW WITH RESPECT TO THE COSTS ISSUE, VACATED THE COURT OF APPEALS OPINION WITH RESPECT TO THE COURT COSTS ONLY AND REMANDED BACK TO THE PERRY CIRCUIT COURT FOR RECONSIDERATION. MINTON, C.J.; ABRAMSON, CUNNINGHAM, KELLER, NOBLE, AND SCOTT, JJ. CONCUR. VENTERS, J. DISSENTS AND WOULD GRANT

DISCRETIONARY REVIEW WITH RESPECT TO

### OPINIONS AND ORDERS - MAY 23, 2013

THE SUPPRESSION ISSUE.

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. <u>2012-SC-000166-KB</u> IN SUPREME TO BE PUBLISHED COURT

ORDER PERMANENTLY DISBARRED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW.

MINTON, C.J.; ABRAMSON, NOBLE AND VENTERS, JJ., CONCUR. SCOTT, J., DISSENTS BY SEPARATE OPINION IN WHICH KELLER, J., JOINS. CUNNINGHAM, J., NOT SITTING.

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. <u>2012-SC-000666-KB</u> IN SUPREME ERIC C. DETERS <u>2012-SC-000667-KB</u> COURT

TO BE PUBLISHED

ORDER SUSPENDED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR 60 DAYS.

MINTON, C.J.; ABRAMSON, CUNNINGHAM, KELLER, NOBLE AND VENTERS, JJ., CONCUR. SCOTT, J., NOT SITTING.

### **MAY 23, 2013 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

## **OPINIONS AND ORDERS - MAY 23, 2013**

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. KATHLEEN S. HARDY ORDER SUSPENDED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW IN THE COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY UNTIL PROOF IS FILED WITH THIS COURT THAT SHE HAS COMPLETED THE REQUIREMENTS AS ORDERED BY THE OHIO SUPREME COURT. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2012-SC-000799-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. MURRAY J. PORATH ORDER SUSPENDED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR 30 DAYS. MINTON, C.J.; CUNNINGHAM, KELLER, NOBLE, SCOTT AND VENTERS, JJ., CONCUR. ABRAMSON, J., NOT SITTING.	2012-SC-000832-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. RODNEY S. JUSTICE ORDER SUSPENDED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR 30 DAYS. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2013-SC-000154-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. MURRAY J. PORATH ORDER SUSPENDED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR 181 DAYS. MINTON, C.J.; CUNNINGHAM, KELLER, NOBLE, SCOTT AND VENTERS, JJ., CONCUR. ABRAMSON, J., NOT SITTING.	2013-SC-000162-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT

### **MAY 23, 2013 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

## **OPINIONS AND ORDERS - MAY 23, 2013**

THE NEGOTIATED SANCTION AND IMPOSE A SIXTY-DAY SUSPENSION FOR AULENBACH, WITH THIRTY DAYS PROBATED FOR ONE

YEAR.

KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. KIMBERLY S.I. GEVEDON ORDER SUSPENDED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR 30 DAYS. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2013-SC-000163-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION V. EARL C. MULLINS, JR. ORDER SUSPENDED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR 90 DAYS, 60 DAYS OF WHICH ARE PROBATED FOR TWO YEARS, WITH CONDITIONS. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2013-SC-000169-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
DAVID WON-IHL SON V. KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION ORDER SUSPENDED MOVANT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR 30 DAYS, PROBATED FOR TWO YEARS WITH CONDITIONS. ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.	2013-SC-000213-KB TO BE PUBLISHED	IN SUPREME COURT
W. CRAIG AULENBACH V. KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION ORDER SUSPENDED MOVANT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR 30 DAYS, PROBATED FOR ONE YEAR WITH CONDITION MINTON, C.J.; ABRAMSON, CUNNINGHAM, KELLER, NOBLE AND VENTERS, JJ., CONCUR SCOTT, J., DISSENTS AND WOULD REJECT		IN SUPREME COURT

### **MAY 23, 2013 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

### **OPINIONS AND ORDERS - MAY 23, 2013**

ROBERT M. ALEXANDER V. 2013-SC-000229-KB IN SUPREME KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION TO BE PUBLISHED COURT ORDER SUSPENDED MOVANT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR 30 DAYS.

ABRAMSON, CUNNINGHAM, KELLER,

NOBLE, SCOTT, AND VENTERS JJ., CONCUR.

MINTON, C.J., NOT SITTING.

WILLIAM R. PALMER, JR. V. <u>2013-SC-000233-KB</u> IN SUPREME KENTUCKY BAR ASSOCIATION **TO BE PUBLISHED** COURT

ORDER SUSPENDED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE OF LAW FOR ONE YEAR.

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

## <u>COURT ORDERS GRANTING MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW – MAY 15, 2013</u>

MV TRANSPORATATION, INC. V. 2012-SC-000462-DG JEFFERSON

RICHARD G. ALLGEIER, EXECUTOR OF THE ESTATE OF BARBARA ALLGEIER, DECEASED

MARY BELL, ET AL. V. 2012-SC-000600-DG FRANKLIN

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, CABINET FOR HEALTH AND FAMILY SERVICES, DEPARTMENT FOR COMMUNITY BASED SERVICES

VIRGIN MOBILE U.S.A., L.P. V. 2012-SC-000621-DG JEFFERSON

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY ON BEHALF OF COMMERCIAL MOBILE RADIO SERVICE TELECOMMUNICATIONS BOARD AND

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY, ON 2012-SC-000626-DG JEFFERSON

BEHALF OF COMMERCIAL MOBILE RADIO SERVICE TELECOMMUNICATIONS BOARD  ${f v}$ .

VIRGIN MOBILE U.S.A., L.P.

### **MAY 23, 2013 MINUTES**

COURT ORDERS GRANTING MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW – MAY 15, 2013			
EDNA BRATTON INDIVIDUALLY, AND AS EXECUTRIX OF THE ESTATE OF R.G. BRATTON <b>V.</b> CITIFINANCIAL, INC.	2012-SC-000630-DG	FAYETTE	
COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY <b>V.</b> CHARLES P. FARMER	2013-SC-000120-DGE	RUSSELL	
COURT ORDERS DENYING MOTION FOR DISC MAY 15, 2013	CRETIONARY REVIEW -		
VELDA GOSSETT AND ANTHONY GOSSETT V. MERRILL CROCKETT THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED. VENTERS, J., NOT SITTING.	2012-SC-000310-D	PULASKI	
JOHN R. SCHMIDT V. NEW YORK BANK MELLON SCOTT, J., NOT SITTING.	2012-SC-000326-D	KENTON	
BARNEY JONES, INDIVIDUALLY, AND AS SHERIFF OF BARREN COUNTY, ET AL. V. JASON H. CROSS, ET AL. MINTON, C.J., NOT SITTING.	2012-SC-000328-D	BARREN	
CHAD ZIMMERMAN V. THE BANK OF NEW YORK MELLON TRUST CO., N.A. SCOTT, J., NOT SITTING.	2012-SC-000354-D	HENRY	
SUSAN M. JOST AND KEVIN ALFORD V. KENNETH R. KNOWLES, ET AL. MINTON, C.J., NOT SITTING.	2012-SC-000383-D	LOGAN	
GEORGE EDWARD MALONE V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY ABRAMSON, J., NOT SITTING.	2012-SC-000430-D	JEFFERSON	

## **MAY 23, 2013 MINUTES**

COURT ORDERS DENYING MOTION FOR DISC MAY 15, 2013	CRETIONARY REVIEW –	
DEREK R. TRUMBO V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY VENTERS, J., WOULD GRANT.	2012-SC-000551-D	JEFFERSON
WILLIAM PETREY <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2012-SC-000585-D	KENTON
LUTHER CREECH V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY KELLER, J., NOT SITTING.	2012-SC-000593-D	OLDHAM
DAVID NOEL <b>V.</b> PEOPLES EXCHANGE BANK OF BEATTYVILLE, KENTUCKY, INC., ET AL.	2012-SC-000610-D	FAYETTE
LUTHER CREECH V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY KELLER, J., NOT SITTING.	2012-SC-000616-D	GARRARD
STEVEN BRADLEY GILES V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY SCOTT, J., WOULD GRANT.	2012-SC-000625-D	MCCRACKEN
TIMOTHY M. SMITH <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2012-SC-000629-D	KENTON
WILLIAM ERIC JONES V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY VENTERS J., WOULD GRANT.	2012-SC-000637-D	GRAVES
KENTUCKY COMMUNITY AND TECHNICAL COLLEGE SYSTEM (KCTCS) V. PAXTON MEDIA GROUP, LLC, D/B/A OWENSBORO MESSENGER-INQUIRER, INC. CUNNINGHAM, J., WOULD GRANT.	2012-SC-000639-D	WOODFORD

### **MAY 23, 2013 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

# <u>COURT ORDERS DENYING MOTION FOR DISCRETIONARY REVIEW – MAY 15, 2013</u>

VALARIE M. ROBERTS, INDIVIDUALLY, AND AS EXECUTRIX OF THE ESTATE OF WILLIAM A. ROBERTS, DECEASED, ET AL. V. JOHN K. ROBERTS AND ROBERTS MOTOR SALES, INC.  THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED.	2012-SC-000640-D	DAVIESS
BELINDA YVONNE HOWARD, NOW FLETCHER <b>V.</b> LESLIE MARK HOWARD	2012-SC-000654-D	GREENUP
HENRY LEE FOWLER, JR. <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2012-SC-000655-D	JEFFERSON
JASON RUSSELL V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY KELLER, J., NOT SITTING.	2012-SC-000658-D	FAYETTE
CITY OF EARLINGTON V. EDITH UTTERBACK THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED.	2012-SC-000659-D	HOPKINS
BLACKSTONE MINING COMPANY, INC. V. THE TRAVELERS INSURANCE COMPANY KELLER, J., NOT SITTING.	2012-SC-000671-D	PIKE
KEVIN LAMONT SIMMS <b>V</b> . COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2012-SC-000674-D	JEFFERSON
BRIDGETT SELF, ADMINISTRATRIX OF THE ESTATE OF MARY DANIEL WHELAN DOWNS, ET AL. V. BARRY MANTOOTH, KAREN MANTOOTH AND HORACE EUGENE "GENO" DOWNS KELLER, J., NOT SITTING.	2012-SC-000676-D	JEFFERSON

## **MAY 23, 2013 MINUTES**

COURT ORDERS DENYING MOTION FOR DISC MAY 15, 2013	CRETIONARY REVIEW -	
DEENA REICHWEIN, INDIVIDUALLY, ET AL. <b>V.</b> JACKSON PURCHASE ENERGY CORPORATION	2012-SC-000679-D	MCCRACKEN
SEAN NOAKES <b>V</b> . COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2012-SC-000680-D	BOONE
JIMMIE R. POLLARD <b>V.</b> CSX TRANSPORATATION, INC.	2012-SC-000698-D	PERRY
JULIANNE MAY YOUNG V. LOU MAY RICHARDSON, ET AL. THE OPINION OF THE COURT OF APPEALS IS ORDERED NOT TO BE PUBLISHED.	2012-SC-000699-D	MARION
TERESA BREWER V. COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY KELLER, J., NOT SITTING.	2012-SC-000765-D	HART
EDDIE K. JARVIS V. ROBERT KEY, ET AL. SCOTT, J., WOULD GRANT.	2012-SC-000781-D	CLINTON
SANDRA SPREACKER V. DENISE VAUGHN, ET AL. KELLER, J., WOULD GRANT.	2013-SC-000013-DE	GREENUP
CHEYENNE ROBERT FAIRCLOTH <b>V.</b> COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY	2013-SC-000064-DE	FAYETTE

### **MAY 23, 2013 MINUTES**

RELEASED: 10:00 A.M.

### **COURT ORDERS GRANTING PETITION FOR REHEARING – MAY 23, 2013**

ANGELA BAUMIA **V.** <u>2011-SC-000279-MR</u> JEFFERSON

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY TO BE PUBLISHED

ORDER MODIFIED THE OPINION OF THE COURT BY JUSTICE SCOTT, RENDERED NOVEMBER 21, 2012, BY SUBSTITUTION OF THIS OPINION IN LIEU OF THE ORIGINAL.

**COURT ORDERS DENYING PETITION FOR REHEARING - MAY 23, 2013** 

CHRISTOPHER STEWARD V. 2011-SC-000393-MR KENTON

COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

CONNIE ROBERTSON, ETC. V. 2012-SC-000387-MR FROM COURT

HONORABLE JEFFREY T. BURDETTE, JUDGE, OF APPEALS

PULASKI CIRCUIT COURT, DIVISION II, ET AL.

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.

**COURT ORDERS DISMISSING** 

WENDELL SMITH, ADMINISTRATOR OF THE 2012-SC-000841-D JEFFERSON

ESTATE OF RACHEL ROBERTS, ETC. V.

DEXTER COLEMAN, ET AL. ENTERED: MAY 16, 2013

COURT ORDERS

INQUIRY COMMISSION V. <u>2013-SC-000131-KB</u> IN SUPREME

DENNIS MICHAEL RITCHIE TO BE PUBLISHED COURT

ORDER TEMPORARILY SUSPENDED RESPONDENT FROM THE PRACTICE

OF LAW.

ALL SITTING. ALL CONCUR.